

**RFP19-02**

**ENVIRONMENTAL COMPLIANCE, INSPECTION & CONSULTING SERVICES**

**- Evaluation & Recommendation -**

**Background:** The Woodbridge Township School District is known throughout New Jersey for being one of the largest K-12 districts in the State. A total of approximately 14,000 students attend our twenty-five schools: seventeen elementary (K-5), five middle schools (6-8), and three high schools (9-12). One of those elementary schools is a full-day kindergarten only school. In addition, the district has various learning environments for special needs students.

Recently, our District has encountered some issues relative to asbestos, mold and poor indoor air quality. Therefore, we are seeking assistance and industry expertise to take over the management of the environmental compliance, inspection and consulting needs for the district. The health and safety of our students and staff is our most crucial priority and so it is critical that we can utilize a company that understands the needs and expectations of the District when it comes to environmental compliance and the needs of our District.

**Procurement Method:** Pursuant to 18A:18A-1 et seq. and 40A:11-4.5 the Woodbridge Township Board of Education (Board) has received permission from the Department of Local Government Services to utilize Competitive Contracting instead of Competitive Bidding for Environmental Compliance, Inspection & Consulting Services. Therefore, this is NOT a bid, but rather a Request for Proposal (RFP). As such, the Woodbridge Township Board of Education shall award the contract to the Bidder whose proposal is determined to be the most advantageous based upon the Evaluation Criteria. The Board is not required to award on the basis of lowest price and will award based on criteria as outlined in this request for proposal. The RFP is being made to ensure the District receives the highest quality service at a fair and competitive price.

The Board reserves the right to waive informalities in a proposal. Proposals that contain a material defect shall be disqualified and given no further consideration at the Board's sole discretion.

**Request For Proposals (RFP):** The Environmental Compliance, Inspection & Consulting Services RFP was advertised on March 21, 2019 and ten (10) potential firms sought and received the Specifications.

**Proposal Opening:** Four (4) proposals were submitted and opened on April 9, 2019 with the following results:

**AHERA Consultants Inc.**

PO BOX 385  
Oceanville, NJ 08231-0385

Fee Structure Proposed:

<b><u>Services Performed</u></b>	<b><u>Cost of Services</u></b>
Hourly rate for environmental consultant to prepare reports and perform site inspections	\$60.00 per hour
Bulk Sampling unit cost for PLM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$20.00 per sample
Bulk Sampling unit cost for TEM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$70.00 per sample
Additional services	Fee schedule included in proposal

Woodbridge Township Board of Education  
421 School Street  
Woodbridge, New Jersey 07095

**Brinkerhoff Environmental Services, Inc.**

1805 Atlantic Avenue  
Manasquan, NJ 08736

Fee Structure Proposed:

<b><u>Services Performed</u></b>	<b><u>Cost of Services</u></b>
Hourly rate for environmental consultant to prepare reports and perform site inspections	\$95.00 per hour
Bulk Sampling unit cost for PLM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$9.15 per sample
Bulk Sampling unit cost for TEM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$65.00 per sample
Additional services	Fee schedule included in proposal

**McCabe Environmental Services, LLC**

464 Valley Brook Avenue  
Lyndhurst, NJ 07071

Fee Structure Proposed:

<b><u>Services Performed</u></b>	<b><u>Cost of Services</u></b>
Hourly rate for environmental consultant to prepare reports and perform site inspections	\$70.00 per hour
Bulk Sampling unit cost for PLM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$10.00 per sample (PLM Friable) \$18.00 per sample (PLM-NOB)
Bulk Sampling unit cost for TEM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$45.00 per sample
Additional services	Fee schedule included in proposal

**TTI Environmental, Inc.**

1253 North Church Street  
Moorestown, NJ 08057

Fee Structure Proposed:

<b><u>Services Performed</u></b>	<b><u>Cost of Services</u></b>
Hourly rate for environmental consultant to prepare reports and perform site inspections	\$95.00 per hour
Bulk Sampling unit cost for PLM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$10.00 per sample
Bulk Sampling unit cost for TEM testing (assuming 48 hours processing time)	\$76.00 per sample
Additional services	Fee schedule included in proposal

Woodbridge Township Board of Education  
421 School Street  
Woodbridge, New Jersey 07095

**RFP Evaluation Method:** The District will form an evaluation committee to assess all the proposals in a fair, consistent and unbiased manner. The end result of this process will be the selection of the best combination of the program, performance and competent management for the District relative to Environmental Compliance, Inspection & Consulting Services. Proposals will be evaluated on the following criteria as set forth in NJAC 5:34-4.2: The recommended criteria are found in N.J.A.C. 5:34-4.2:

- I. Technical Criteria
- II. Management Criteria
- III. Cost Criteria

**Evaluation of Proposals:** The criteria that will be considered in evaluating proposals are the criteria as detailed in the following table. They are valued based upon importance to the District. After the points are awarded by the evaluator, the scores will be totaled for each vendor submitting a proposal. Based upon the score, the Evaluation Committee will then recommend a Contractor to the School Board for the award of the contract. Each area of the evaluation should be addressed in detail in the contractor's proposal. The following are the criteria:

	<b><u>Category</u></b>	<b><u>Value Points</u></b>
I.	Technical Criteria A. Description of Goods/ Services	33 points
II.	Management Criteria A. Business Management (17 points available)  B. Qualifications; Relevant Experience (17 points available)	34 points
III.	Cost Criteria A. Fee Proposal	33 points

A committee has been selected to evaluate proposals that have been submitted. Committee members are familiar with the need for services to be performed in the request for proposal.

**Evaluation Committee:** A panel of four (4) members, consisting of District administrators and a Board member, served on the Evaluation Committee.

Woodbridge Township Board of Education  
421 School Street  
Woodbridge, New Jersey 07095

**Evaluation of Proposals:** On April 9, 2019, the Evaluation Committee reviewed each of the four (4) companies that submitted proposals as provided above. Responses were graded in each of the sections of the Evaluation Criteria. Score sheets were completed by each committee member and were tabulated by the Business Administrator's Office. As per the RFP specifications, all points were tallied within the three sections of the scoring criteria and a total score derived. While each of the proposers shared insight into the management of environmental compliance, inspection and consulting services for the District, the committee felt that the proposal by AHERA Consultants best met the needs of the district.

The results, in order of overall performance, are as follows:

1. AHERA Consultants Inc. – AHERA Consultants, Inc. has the technical experience required for District needs. They can provide 3-year re-inspections and 6-month surveillance. They are able to perform emergency and non-emergency inspections, air testing and sampling. They also can design a plan for how to deal with issues in the future. Company management has over 30 years of industry experience and has vast experience within the Woodbridge Township School District. Costs for hourly consultants were the lowest among the four firms who responded.
2. McCabe Environmental Services LLC – McCabe Environmental Services, LLC has much of the technical experiences required for district needs. However, 3-year inspections and 6-month surveillance were not mentioned. They perform indoor air quality testing and offer safety training and asbestos management programs and monitoring. They have over 25 years of experience. Much of their work has been in association with one specific architectural firm. They have limited experience in the Woodbridge Township School District. McCabe's pricing structure was close to the lowest on consulting and lowest on bulk sampling.
3. Brinkerhoff Environmental Services, Inc. – Brinkerhoff Environmental Services, Inc. can provide indoor air quality testing, an asbestos management program, school inspections, and bulk sample testing. The company president has over 25 years of technical and management experience. Brinkerhoff has limited school district experience and none in Woodbridge. Costs were amongst the highest of the four submissions.
4. TTI Environmental, Inc. – TTI Environmental, LLC has technical ability to provide asbestos abatement design and oversight and indoor air quality evaluations. TTI was founded in 1985. The company does have some school district experience but it seems limited to specific projects. Costs for TTI were the highest of any submission.

**Recommendation:** It is the Evaluation Committee's recommendation to the Board of Education to approve AHERA Consultants, Inc. to provide Environmental Compliance, Inspection & Consulting Services to the Woodbridge Township School District. AHERA Consultants Inc. has the most experience in school districts and the most within prior experience within the Woodbridge Township School District. They were also the lowest cost for hourly consultations. Based on these factors, AHERA Consultants, Inc. scored the highest number of points in our evaluations.